



## Durham Research Online

---

### Deposited in DRO:

21 May 2009

### Version of attached file:

Published Version

### Peer-review status of attached file:

Peer-reviewed

### Citation for published item:

Bell, S. (2002) 'Scandals in emerging Western Buddhism.', in *Westward Dharma : Buddhism beyond Asia*. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 230-242.

### Further information on publisher's website:

<http://www.ucpress.edu/books/pages/9178.html>

### Publisher's copyright statement:

### Additional information:

## Use policy

---

The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that:

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a [link](#) is made to the metadata record in DRO
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the [full DRO policy](#) for further details.



## Durham Research Online

---

**Deposited in DRO:**

21 May 2009

**Peer-review status of attached file:**

Peer-reviewed

**Publication status of attached file:**

Published

**Citation for published item:**

Bell, S. (2002) 'Scandals in emerging Western Buddhism.', in Westward Dharma : Buddhism beyond Asia. Berkeley: University of California Press, pp. 230-242.

**Further information on publisher's website:**

<http://www.ucpress.edu/books/pages/9178.html>

## Use policy

---

The full-text may be used and/or reproduced, and given to third parties in any format or medium, without prior permission or charge, for personal research or study, educational, or not-for-profit purposes provided that :

- a full bibliographic reference is made to the original source
- a link is made to the metadata record in DRO
- the full-text is not changed in any way

The full-text must not be sold in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

Please consult the full [DRO policy](#) for further details.

Durham University Library, Stockton Road, Durham DH1 3LY, United Kingdom  
Tel : +44 (0)191 334 2975 | Fax : +44 (0)191 334 2971  
<http://dro.dur.ac.uk>

# 15 Scandals in Emerging Western Buddhism

Sandra Bell

## INTRODUCTION

In the spring of 1993, a group of twenty-two Western Dharma teachers from ten different countries in Europe and North America gathered at Dharamsala in north India for a conference with the Dalai Lama. The purpose of the meeting was, in the words of convener Lama Surya Das, to "honestly discuss—in a frank and open forum—the issues and problems involved with transmitting the Buddhadharma from the East to Western lands today."<sup>1</sup> One of the main themes to emerge was "the undeniable importance of the spiritual teacher as a role model—an exemplary one, hopefully—and the ethical responsibilities connected with such a role."<sup>2</sup> The significance that the conference attached to the teacher/student relationship reflects a major feature of Buddhism in the West, where lay Buddhists are most likely to be practicing meditation. The popularity of meditation in the West means that the pedagogical model is a central organizing principle in the formation of Buddhist institutions, for, as Peter Harvey remarks, "any type of meditation" calls for guidance from a teacher.<sup>3</sup> Harvey goes on: meditation requires personal guidance, as it is a subtle skill that cannot be properly conveyed by standardized written teachings. The teacher gets to know his student, guides him or her through difficulties as they occur, and guards against the inappropriate use of the powerful means of self-change that meditation provides. In return, the student must apply himself well to the practice and be open to where it leads."<sup>4</sup>

This description captures vividly the personal qualities and accomplishments both teacher and student need to draw upon for a successful outcome, but it also evokes the potential psychological dangers for both parties. If the teacher or the student fails to measure up to these stringent requirements, the result may be more damaging than a mere sense of disappointment. For teachers to acquire students, they need credibility, which is demonstrated by their possession of certain credentials. A major source

of credentials is rooted in the position that a teacher occupies within a spiritual lineage based on the principle of pupillary succession. Traditionally in Buddhism, the teacher (*guru*) claims his, or more rarely her, spiritual legitimacy as the representative of an unbroken lineage that can be traced back through a sequence of distinguished names to a saintly founder, or even to the Buddha himself. The teacher's person and conduct are thereby regarded as an embodiment of the moral and spiritual dimensions of Buddhist teachings (Dharma). It is this ideal that underlies the role of teacher as exemplar and shapes the asymmetrical charismatic relationship between a teacher and his students.

However, the exact nature of exemplary behavior in a teacher can undergo subtle variation, depending on one's choice of Buddhist tradition, lineage, cultural location, and historical period. There is a world of difference between what might be considered acceptable conduct by a follower of the *drubnyon* philosophy in historical Tibet, discussed below, compared, for example, to what is appropriate conduct for ascetic forest monks of the Theravāda tradition of South and Southeast Asia. In contemporary Britain and North America, Buddhists are most likely to be well-educated, white, middle-class folk of liberal persuasion who display permissive attitudes toward their teachers' eccentric behavior and minor indiscretions. But events have shown that tolerance breaks down when teachers make persistent use of the power they wield over their followers to obtain material goods and sexual favors. In this chapter, I will argue that scandals resulting from this kind of conduct by teachers are most likely to occur in organizations that are in transition between the pure forms of charismatic authority that brought them into being and more rational, corporate forms of organization. However, I also propose that despite the constraining effects of the shift to corporate organizational structures, relations between individual meditation teachers and their students continue to retain inherent, and potentially disruptive, charismatic qualities.

By the beginning of the 1990s, several scandals occurred among Buddhist groups in the West. Writing in 1988, the American *vipassanā* teacher Jack Kornfield warned, "Already upheavals over teacher behavior and abuse have occurred at dozens (if not the majority) of the major Buddhist and Hindu centers in America."<sup>5</sup> The reputations of teachers had been compromised and disciples psychologically damaged amid accusations of sexual misconduct, alcohol abuse, financial irregularities, and spiritual waywardness.<sup>6</sup>

The discussion will focus on narrative sketches of two Western Buddhist organizations that have faced such issues, the San Francisco Zen Center and

Shambhala International (previously known as Vajradhatu). These organizations were selected because I had the opportunity to investigate them and not because they represent the worst of what has occurred. Plenty of other examples from Britain and the United States could have been drawn upon. Jack Kornfield is a long-standing teacher and promoter of Buddhism in the West. His preparedness to face up to the scale of the problem, as he saw it twelve years ago, is a strong indicator of its pervasiveness, while subsequent and current reports imply that these difficulties have not evaporated.<sup>7</sup> The two examples are drawn from very different Buddhist traditions.

The San Francisco Zen Center was founded by Shunryu Suzuki Rōshi, a Japanese priest belonging to the Sōtō Zen lineage, who arrived in San Francisco in 1959 to serve as priest to the Japanese Sokoji Sōtō Zen Temple.<sup>8</sup> Suzuki Rōshi acquired students from beyond the Japanese-American community and eventually these students came to occupy a section of the temple that became known as the San Francisco Zen Center. In 1966, this group founded Tassajara, the first residential Zen center in the West. At Tassajara, practitioners could follow the traditions of a Japanese Sōtō monastery in a remote location. In 1969, the original urban San Francisco Zen Center moved to much larger premises, separate from the Japanese Sokoji Sōtō Zen Temple.

Vajradhatu was founded in 1973 in Boulder, Colorado, by an exiled Tibetan *lama* of the Kagyu lineage, Chōgyam Trungpa Rinpoche (1939–87). In 1983, a major center was established in Halifax, Nova Scotia, where the movement's international headquarters are currently located.

Despite the differences between these two centers, in spiritual orientation, history, and location, several themes will arise that are common to them both, as well as to other groups not covered here.<sup>9</sup>

#### VAJRADHATU / SHAMBHALA

Chōgyam Trungpa was raised and trained as a religious leader from the age of one, when he was acknowledged as a reincarnate *lama* (Tib. *tulku*) and enthroned as the 11th Trungpa Tulku, supreme *lama* of the Surmang group of monasteries in eastern Tibet. The Surmang monasteries are affiliated to the Karma Kagyupa lineage of Tibetan Buddhism (the Karmapas), and their founding is closely associated with a lineage of famous saints (Skt. *siddha*), including Tilopa, Naropa, Marpa, and Milarepa. Milarepa, a poet, was eulogized by the saintly and erratically behaved *lamas* of the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries (Tib. *drubnyon*). Stories and myths in the Tibetan



oral and literary traditions evolved around the paradoxical notion of disruptive holiness, personified by spiritually insightful characters who nevertheless “perpetually engaged in one sort of perverse activity or another—drinking to excess, fornicating, thieving, defying authority, playing magical tricks. . . .”<sup>10</sup> These kinds of religious figures are not all placed in the distant past and examples survive into modern times, among them one of Chögyam Trungpa’s teachers, Kenpo Gangshar.<sup>11</sup>

Chögyam Trungpa encouraged his disciples to follow the *drubnyon* philosophy, which traditionally combines exceptional insight and impressive magical power with a flamboyant disregard for conventional behavior. He translated the anarchic ideology of the *drubnyon* into English by use of the term *crazy wisdom*, and that phrase became the hallmark of his charismatic leadership of Vajradhatu.<sup>12</sup> Chögyam Trungpa’s appeal to the crazy-wisdom tradition did not in any way detract from the characteristic role of the guru that lies at the heart of Vajrayāna Buddhist practices and that Chögyam Trungpa continued to endorse among his American followers. Practitioners of the higher Tantra believe that its doctrines and practices were taught by the Buddha’s Tantric form, Vajradhara, and that it is necessary to see all *lamas*, and in particular one’s personal *root lama* (Tib. *tsawe lama*), as the Buddha (Vajradhara). Though a practitioner may have other teachers, the personal *lama*, who is unlikely to be the one who initiated the student into Tantric practices, holds a special place in the student’s heart and should inspire fierce loyalty and devotion.

Stephen Butterfield, a former member of Vajradhatu, followed the arduous and lengthy spiritual regime founded on devotion to Chögyam Trungpa as guru known as *ngöndro*.<sup>13</sup> He later wrote, “The single most important quality demanded of the Vajrayāna student is devotion to the guru. . . . The guru is the Buddha. . . . To regard the guru as an ordinary person is a perverted attitude. No matter what the guru does, you must accept it as a teaching.”<sup>14</sup>

The large house that Chögyam Trungpa and his English wife occupied in an upper-class district of Boulder was known as the Kalapa Court. Disciples were admitted by invitation only. The residence was sumptuously appointed and organized to reflect a courtly hierarchy, with followers eager to serve as cleaners, attendants, guards, cooks, and so on. Here Chögyam Trungpa was surrounded by an inner circle whose members took a vow not to reveal or discuss his behavior, although it was openly acknowledged that he had sexual relations with a number of his female disciples.<sup>15</sup> The disciples were also unrestrained in their sexual liaisons, believing that sexual jealousy indicated a failure to grasp Chögyam Trungpa’s teaching. The

resulting tensions led to emotionally charged relationships between individual members of the Vajradhatu community, referred to as the Sangha, and added to the shared intensity of the collective experience.

In 1976, Chögyam Trungpa appointed Thomas Rich, one of his American disciples, as his Vajra Regent and gave him the Tibetan name of Ösel Tendzin. Upon Chögyam Trungpa's death in 1987, Ösel Tendzin inherited his master's spiritual and administrative authority, including the power to override all decisions made by Vajradhatu's board of directors. In December 1988, members of the board of directors revealed that Ösel Tendzin was HIV positive. Furthermore, he had known about his condition for four years and had continued to practice unprotected sex with male, and some female, members of the Sangha. One of the young men with whom Ösel Tendzin had unprotected sex later contracted AIDS and died, after passing the infection on to a girlfriend. It also came to light that members of the board had known about the regent's condition for some time, though they had taken no action.

A period of turmoil followed. Some members left; some called for Ösel Tendzin's resignation as president of Vajradhatu, but stopped short of suggesting he give up his spiritual inheritance; others wanted him stripped of all positions; and others stuck by him. Appeals were made from all sides to eminent Tibetan *lamas* in the Karma Kagyupa lineage and to Dilgo Khyentse, an important *lama* of the Nyingmapa order, who had acted as a teacher to Chögyam Trungpa in Tibet and presided over his cremation ceremony. In the early spring of 1990, Ösel Tendzin accepted Dilgo Khyentse's advice to go into retreat. He died the following August.

After Ösel Tendzin's death, Vajradhatu began a slow period of recovery. Under the urging of Dilgo Khyentse, the now-weakened board of directors agreed to the appointment of Chögyam Trungpa's son, known as the Sawang, as the new leader in 1990. One of his first actions was to disband the board of directors and appoint a new board, to be known as the Kalapa Council. His leadership style was cautious and consultative. A member of the Kalapa Council who had previously served on the old board of directors summarized the major change in organizational style in an interview in 1994: "People no longer depend on a charismatic teacher to be a reference point."

As part of an adaptive strategy intended to revitalize the membership, the new leadership built on groundwork laid by Chögyam Trungpa in the mid-1970s when he introduced "a parallel and supposedly 'secular' form of meditation practice" known as Shambhala Training.<sup>16</sup> The name is drawn from a Tibetan myth that features a kingdom of enlightened beings ruled by sagacious monarchs. The intention of the training is to create people

capable of establishing a society in this world that mirrors the Shambhala kingdom. Participants can adhere to their own religious preferences and do not have to think of themselves as Buddhists. Nevertheless, the movement continues to support contemplative centers such as Gampo Abbey in Nova Scotia and conducts weddings and funerals. It promotes education and training programs aimed at business corporations as well as individuals. All of these activities are intended to contribute to Shambhala International's goal of creating what is described as an "enlightened society." For many members, however, their participation remains rooted in their long-standing personal practice based on Chögyam Trungpa's interpretation of Vajrayāna Buddhism.<sup>17</sup>

#### THE SAN FRANCISCO ZEN CENTER

Richard Baker was a Harvard graduate who studied with Suzuki Rōshi for ten years before being appointed his successor. In 1971, Suzuki Rōshi made Richard Baker abbot with authority over the San Francisco Zen Center's growing community of practitioners and associated centers. Baker possessed a great deal of energy, together with entrepreneurial drive and skills. Under his leadership, the Zen Center established Green Gulch Zen Farm, a practice community in Martin County; the Tassajara Bread Bakery, which became famous through the publication of cook books; and Greens Restaurant, which served up the vegetables grown on the farm. All of these ventures were extremely successful, but Baker seemed to find it hard to delegate authority to other senior practitioners within the expanding organization.

Baker exerted enormous spiritual and institutional authority within the Zen Center's cluster of establishments. The center itself did have a board of directors, consisting of all of the people who had received their ordination as priests from Suzuki Rōshi. But the board met sporadically, and decision-making fell into Baker's hands. However, in spring 1983 a meeting was convened and as a result Baker took an indefinite leave of absence. An item in the winter edition of the center's journal, *Windbell*, explained: "The precipitating event which brought this about was his [Baker's] relationship with a married resident woman student, and the upset which this caused for those principally involved, and for others in the community who knew about it."<sup>18</sup> The item stated that Baker, also married, had been "involved in similar situations before." All this was especially upsetting because Baker had previously told students that although Zen practice did not involve celibacy for priests or laypeople, a person's sexual conduct should not



deceive or harm others, while a teacher's behavior should be exemplary. The respected teacher appeared to have broken his own precepts. Disputes remain over what did actually take place. Baker, who has since founded the Dharma Sangha in Europe and the United States, said in an interview published in 1994, "It is as hard to say what I have learned as it is to say what happened."<sup>19</sup>

Senior members recollect that initially Baker did not seem to accept or understand why so many people were so upset. "I think that made things worse," said one. There is some substance for this observation. In the 1994 interview, Baker said, "I had a kind of insecurity and self-importance, which I didn't see for a long time, that was a bad dynamic in the community. . . . I only saw my own motivations and I only trusted my motivations. The problem with that is, I didn't see how that affected others. So I didn't really have sympathy for people. Or empathy."<sup>20</sup>

The *Windbell* item written in the wake of the crisis explained why the event created a "catalyst" leading to an examination of "many fundamental questions concerning our understanding of Buddhism and Buddhist institutions."<sup>21</sup> Many members were completely immersed in the organization; their involvement represented the sum of their everyday lives. "For resident members, especially, whose work, spiritual practice, social life, and, in many cases, financial support are all provided within the institution of Zen Center, these questions, understandably, have become very important and disturbing."<sup>22</sup> It seems clear that the sexual scandal was a spark that ignited a great deal of discontent within the center.

Baker was perceived to have failed to treat other priests, who had also received ordination from Suzuki Rōshi, as equals and peers. Expansion took place at great speed, but little attention was paid to the overall organizational structures of control and decision-making. Baker grew removed from the ebb and flow of community life, and was protected from the complaints and suspicions that surrounded him by an inner circle of "courtiers."<sup>23</sup> The expansion of the center and its associated businesses meant that many students worked within the organization for long hours and low wages, while Baker spent more than two hundred thousand dollars in one year and drove an expensive BMW. There was an unsustainable gulf between the material world inhabited by the abbot and the lifestyles of many of the students, whose labors and financial contributions were sustaining him.

The Zen Center's recovery from its uncomfortable history has been slow but effective. One senior member who was at the center of events in 1983 estimated that it took five or six years for the worst effects to die down and

that a "shadow" remains to this day. Nevertheless, the Zen Center is flourishing once more, with a renewal of interest in membership from those under thirty years of age, while there are more applications for residency at the various centers than there are places to fill. There are tentative plans for a new phase of expansion. Actions aimed at reform were initiated by a committee of volunteers soon after the revelations about Baker became known. Counselors were invited in to help individuals deal with their personal feelings. They also ran group sessions, where people were encouraged to think about how the situation had arisen and to develop a collective response toward change.<sup>24</sup>

Blanche Hartman is currently abbess at San Francisco Zen Center. A former student of Suzuki Rōshi, she received ordination as a priest from Baker in 1977. At the time of the crisis, she expressed the view, shared by many others, that experienced practitioners had unwittingly colluded with Baker by allowing him to become so far removed from criticism. She said, "I told him I thought it had been doing him no service to say nothing about my suspicions. It was a mistake to protect him from the consequences of his own consequential actions."<sup>25</sup> Looking back from her position seventeen years later, she told me, "The heat focused on sexual misconduct, but there were lots of other things that we had to face up to, such as the fact that Baker was only thirty-six years old when he became abbot. While in Japan it is unlikely that anyone would find him- or herself in charge of a training monastery until they were around fifty years old. In addition, Baker became isolated from his peers, who should have been encouraged and enabled to provide support and guidance."

During 1984 and 1985, after Baker's departure, careful efforts were made to remodel the organization of Zen Center and its satellites so that power and leadership became more diffuse.<sup>26</sup> This process began with the first edition of *Windbell* published after the crisis broke. Its pages featured photographs and biographies of a dozen individuals—five of them women—who were described as having "taken on many of the teaching and practice responsibilities at Zen Center."<sup>27</sup> These individuals included Harold (Reb) Anderson, who was appointed abbot of the Zen Center by the board of directors in 1986.

Most of the current structure of the Zen Center was conceived in the aftermath of the scandal. Appointees to the board of directors are elected by the Zen Center's membership. The board meets at least six times a year, and one of its most important functions is to appoint the center's president, abbots, and other officers. Nominations for the roles of president and abbot come from a Council of Elders. The Zen Center, which includes Tassajara,

Green Gulch Farm, and the city center, has two abbots. Tassajara and Green Gulch also have boards of directors and at least two abbots. Each location also runs Practice Committees, consisting of senior practitioners, who meet once a week. In 1992, an Ethics Committee and a subsequent Ethics Review Committee were established to produce a statement, "Ethical Principles and Procedures for Grievance and Reconciliation," that was adopted by the board of directors in 1996. The statement provided for a formal grievance procedure to be set in place.

Attempts have also been made to heal the breach with Baker, who accepted an invitation to attend Abbess Hartman's installation ceremony in 1996. In 1997, her co-abbot, Norman Fischer, organized a retreat with Baker and thirty-five students from the 1970s and early 1980s. Fischer later described the retreat as "not an effort to make peace or become friends again" but as part of a longer process "in the direction of forgiveness."<sup>28</sup> He concluded, "If a Buddhist sangha, a group of people dedicated to compassion and understanding, is not willing to try to heal its own wounds and deal with its difficult past with clarity, trying to prevent further harm in the future, does it make sense to hope that others with even more difficult conditions will be able to do their work?"

## CONCLUSIONS

Many Buddhist movements in the West, including those described here, were founded during the second half of the twentieth century by charismatic leaders, assisted by an initially small group of devoted followers. It is typical that as a movement expands this group evolves into an inner circle, "a charismatic aristocracy,"<sup>29</sup> that stands between the growing membership and the leader. Increased numbers of students mean that over time certain members of the inner circle also become meditation teachers and candidates for succession to the leadership. The founder, as in the current examples, may nominate a successor who, in adopting the mantle of charismatic authority, becomes remote from the other members of the inner circle who were once his peers. This happened to Richard Baker and to Ösel Tendzin.

Once separated from former peers by being raised above them, a new leader can easily lose the sense of how his power depends on others, for as Weber describes it "the effectiveness of charisma lies in the faith of the ruled."<sup>30</sup> The high-handedness that Richard Baker and Ösel Tendzin displayed toward their critics suggests that they misunderstood the source of their own power. As Lindholm points out, "Charisma is, above all, a



*relationship*, a mutual mingling of the inner selves of leader and follower."<sup>31</sup> But, according to his own admission, Baker became blinded to the needs of others by his "self-importance" and lack of "empathy." Ösel Tendzin became so deluded as to believe that he possessed supernatural protection that could prevent HIV from conquering "his body or the extended social body that trusted him."<sup>32</sup> It may be that as Buddhist organizations mature and move away from charismatic leadership toward rationalized and democratically structured models of authority—what Gordon Melton has described as *board leadership*—there will be fewer events like those that occurred at Zen Center and Vajradhatu during the 1980s. Melton has proposed that corporate structures, imposed for tax purposes within new religious movements in the United States, have "given new religious groups an additional stability that no single leader could bequeath."<sup>33</sup> The routinization of charisma into more bureaucratic forms of organization is also mirrored in the management of spiritual hierarchies. For example, resident students at the Zen Center must now have a practice advisor, a senior practitioner whom they have a hand in selecting. Moreover, students can change practice advisors if they wish to do so. Part of Vajradhatu's transformation into Shambhala has involved less focus on devotion to the guru in favor of training workshops, with input from a range of teachers and facilitators.

Nevertheless, in most Buddhist organizations the teacher/student relationship continues to be a central factor, and without careful management there is always a danger of manipulation of the student by the teacher, or that the teacher will succumb to sexually flirtatious students.<sup>34</sup> Devotion to the teacher is encouraged in Buddhism, but devotion readily entails idealization. Such idealization often leads a student to experience strong emotional attachment, with feelings that parallel those associated in Western culture with romantic love and its stress on self-abandonment and glorification of the other.<sup>35</sup>

Mark Epstein, a Buddhist and a psychiatrist, identifies these feelings as stemming from the nature of the spiritual exercise in which the practitioner is engaged:

The pressure to cast off attachment to one's own ego generates a confusion between the compassion that is supposed to grow out of egolessness, the so-called bodhicitta, with its more primitive over-identification with the glorified other [the teacher]. Meditators with this misunderstanding are vulnerable to a kind of eroticized attachment to teachers, gurus or other intimates, towards whom they direct their desires to be released into "into abandon." More often than not they also remain



masochistically entwined with these figures to whom they are trying to surrender.<sup>36</sup>

Certain characteristics that are inherent in the conduct of the relationship, such as privacy and confidentiality, make it additionally prone to romantic and erotic overtones. For example, in order to discuss the progress of meditation practice with their (usually) male teacher, both male and female students are likely to refer to their closest personal relationships and to unearth their deepest feelings. This is a form of intimacy in which the student is exposed in a way that does not apply to the teacher. Such a confessional relationship is also at risk of falling prey to the processes of psychological transference familiar in psychotherapy, whereby the student may project his or her erotic desires onto the teacher.

People who join Buddhist groups are often seeking communitarian alternatives to what they perceive as egocentric, competitive values that prevail in capitalist market economies. However, competitiveness re-emerges within the group as people try to outdo one another in achieving reputations for spiritual attainment or in currying favor with those whose reputations are already established. Butler describes how senior students at the Zen Center "strove to outdo each other for approval of their insight."<sup>37</sup> She quotes a senior monk as saying that when it came to confronting Baker about his behavior, he felt alone, because "you don't feel like the person you are competing with will support you."<sup>38</sup> New students, too, are unlikely to be critical. Their familiar, commonsense understandings are often in a state of suspension as they try to establish their places within the new milieu by learning unfamiliar ways of thinking and behaving. There is no doubt that despite the rhetoric around the notion of community (*Sangha*), which is ubiquitous within Buddhist groups, people can feel isolated. This isolation is exaggerated when anxiety about being ostracized causes meditation students to refrain from challenging the behavior of others, particularly members of a charismatic aristocracy. To do so can feel like betraying the idealized notions of *Sangha* and spiritual friendship that attracted the person to the group in the first place.

Finally, there is the question of whether Buddhist movements that are afflicted with scandals can regain their reputations. The examples suggest that this is indeed possible, if disappointed members have a medium for venting their feelings and listening to one another. At the Zen Center, the formation of affinity groups and the opportunities for counseling constituted such a medium. At Vajradhatu, the creation of a temporary newsletter, entitled *Sangha*, provided an important outlet for disaffected

members.<sup>39</sup> In both examples, board leadership steered a course toward more accessible and open institutional forms, based on rationalized forms of organization. Charismatic authority remains, contained in the relationship between students and their meditation teachers. However, with the advent of more teachers and mentors, it is less concentrated and more readily distinguishable from matters of institutional leadership and governance.

#### NOTES

1. Surya Das, "The Snow Lions Roar: A Report on the Conference of Western Buddhist Meditation Teachers," 1.

2. *Ibid.*, 3.

3. Peter Harvey, *An Introduction to Buddhism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), 244.

4. *Ibid.*

5. Jack Kornfield, "Is Buddhism Changing in North America?" in *Buddhist America: Centers, Retreats, Practices*, edited by Don Morreale (Santa Fe, New Mexico: John Muir Publications, 1988), xviii.

6. Rick Fields, *How the Swans Came to the Lake: A Narrative History of Buddhism in America*, 3rd revised and updated ed. (Boston: Shambhala, 1992), 359–69.

7. See for example Franz Metcalf, "We Think Your Behavior is Harming the Buddhadharmā, a Zen Intervention" (paper delivered at the annual meeting of the Society for the Scientific Study of Religion and the Religious Research Association, San Diego, 7 Nov. 1997). See also newspaper coverage, including Madeleine Bunting, "The Dark Side of Enlightenment," *The Guardian*, 27 Oct. 1997; Vishvapani, "Buddhism Distorted," *The Guardian*, 8 Nov. 1997; Paul Valley, "I Was a Tantric Sex Slave," *The Independent*, 10 Feb. 1999; Jamie Macaskill, "Monks Dirty Habits," *The Scottish Daily Record*, 17 Apr. 2000; Jamie Macaskill, "Sex Row Monk Admits Fondling Boy Disciple," *The Scottish Daily Record*, 18 Apr. 2000; and "Monk on Girl Assault Charge," *The Scottish Daily Record*, 28 Apr. 2000 (no by-line).

8. Fields, *How the Swans Came to the Lake*, 274.

9. See Metcalf, "We Think Your Behavior is Harming the Buddhadharmā."

10. John Ardussi and Lawrence Epstein, "The Saintly Madman in Tibet," in *Himalayan Anthropology: The Indo-Tibetan Interface*, edited by James F. Fisher (The Hague: Mouton, 1978), 327.

11. Geoffrey Samuel, *Civilized Shamans: Buddhism in Tibetan Societies* (Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1993), 307.

12. Sandra Bell, "'Crazy Wisdom,' Charisma, and the Transmission of Buddhism in the United States," *Nova Religio: The Journal of Alternative and Emergent Religions* 2, no. 1 (1999), 55–75.

13. *Ngöndro* requires the completion of 100,000 full-length prostrations, 100,000 mantra recitations, 100,000 recitations of the vow to become a bodhisattva, 100,000 recitations of a formula for seeking refuge in the Buddha and his teaching, and 100,000 repetitions arranging and rearranging a mandala composed of grains of rice.

14. Stephen Butterfield, *The Double Mirror: A Skeptical Journey into Buddhist Tantra* (Berkeley: North Atlantic Books, 1994), 136.

15. Ibid., 100.
16. Lorne Dawson and Lynn Eldershaw, "Shambhala Warriorship: Investigating the Adaptations of Imported New Religious Movements," in *Croyances et Sociétés: communications présentés au dixième colloque international sur les nouveaux mouvements religieux*, edited by Bertrand Ouellet and Richard Bergeron (Québec: Editions Fides, 1996), 209.
17. Ibid.
18. See *Windbell* 17, no. 2 (1983), 2.
19. See *Tricycle: The Buddhist Review* 4, no. 2 (Winter 1994), 35.
20. Ibid., 35.
21. *Windbell* 17, no. 2 (1983), 3.
22. Ibid.
23. Katy Butler, "Events are the Teacher: Working through the Crisis at San Francisco Zen Center," *CoEvolution Quarterly* 40 (Winter 1983), 120.
24. The counselors were not Buddhists, but became so through their contact with Zen Center.
25. Butler, "Events are the Teacher," 115.
26. Baker went on to found the Dharma Sangha, with centers in Germany; Austria; and Crestone, Colorado.
27. *Windbell* 17, no. 2 (1983), 12-8.
28. *Windbell* 31, no. 2 (1997).
29. Max Weber, *Economy and Society* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), 1119.
30. Ibid., 1125.
31. Charles Lindholm, *Charisma* (London: Blackwell, 1990), 7.
32. Stephanie Kane, "Sacred Deviance and AIDS in a North American Buddhist Community," *Law and Policy* 16 (1994), 331.
33. J. Gordon Melton, "Introduction: When Prophets Die," in *When Prophets Die: The Postcharismatic Fate of New Religious Movements*, edited by Timothy Miller (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1991), 8.
34. Butler, "Events are the Teacher," 116.
35. Charles Lindholm, "Love as an Experience of Transcendence," in *Romantic Passion*, edited by William Jankoviak (New York: Columbia University Press, 1995), 68.
36. *Tricycle: The Buddhist Review* 1, no. 3 (Spring 1992), 52.
37. Butler, "Events are the Teacher," 120.
38. Ibid., 121.
39. Bell, "Crazy Wisdom."